

Refuting the Madkhali Murji'ah Position on Criticizing Rulers

Talha Ibn Yusuf Al Hanafi
3 Cemaziyelahir, 1447

Introduction....1
Part 1: Evidence from the Qur'an....2
1. The Command to Enjoin Good and Forbid Evil....2
2. The Obligation to Stand for Justice Even Against Oneself....6
3. The Prohibition of Inclining Toward Oppressors....7
4. The Command to Cooperate Only in Righteousness....8
5. Examples from the Qur'an of Speaking Against Tyrannical Authority....8
3. The Condemnation of Those Who Conceal the Truth....9
Part 2: Evidence from the Sunnah....10
1. The Greatest Jihad....10
2. Accountability of Rulers....11
4. The Example of Abu Bakr (may Allah be pleased with him)....11
5. 'Umar ibn Al-Khattab's Position....12
6. The Prohibition of Obeying in Sin....12
7. Warning Against Silent Scholars....12
9. The Three Types of Jihad....13
Conclusion....13

Introduction

The Madkhali position, which prohibits any form of criticism or rebellion against Muslim rulers regardless of their corruption or tyranny, represents a modern deviation from the established methodology of Ahlus-Sunnah. This article presents a refutation using evidence from the Qur'an and the Sunnah, while also looking at the devastating social and political consequences of absolute obedience to tyrannical authority.

Part 1: Evidence from the Qur'an

1. The Command to Enjoin Good and Forbid Evil

Allah (سبحانه وتعالى) says:

وَلۡتَكُن مِّنكُمۡ أُمَّةٌ يَدۡعُونَ إِلَى ٱلۡخَيۡرِ وَيَأۡمُرُونَ بِٱلۡمَعۡرُوفِ وَيَنۡهَوۡنَ عَنِ ٱلۡمُنكَرِۚ وَأُوْلَٰٓئِكَ هُمُ ٱلۡمُفۡلِحُونَ ١٠٤

Let there be a group among you who call ˹others˺ to goodness, encourage what is good, and forbid what is evil—it is they who will be successful.[1]

كُنتُمۡ خَيۡرَ أُمَّةٍ أُخۡرِجَتۡ لِلنَّاسِ تَأۡمُرُونَ بِٱلۡمَعۡرُوفِ وَتَنۡهَوۡنَ عَنِ ٱلۡمُنكَرِ وَتُؤۡمِنُونَ بِٱللَّهِۗ وَلَوۡ ءَامَنَ أَهۡلُ ٱلۡكِتَٰبِ لَكَانَ خَيۡرٗا لَّهُمۚ مِّنۡهُمُ ٱلۡمُؤۡمِنُونَ وَأَكۡثَرُهُمُ ٱلۡفَٰسِقُونَ ١١٠

You are the best community ever raised for humanity—you encourage good, forbid evil, and believe in Allah. Had the People of the Book believed, it would have been better for them. Some of them are faithful, but most are rebellious.[2]

لَن يَضُرُّوكُمۡ إِلَّآ أَذٗىۖ وَإِن يُقَٰتِلُوكُمۡ يُوَلُّوكُمُ ٱلۡأَدۡبَارَ ثُمَّ لَا يُنصَرُونَ ١١١

They can never inflict harm on you, except a little annoyance.1 But if they meet you in battle, they will flee and they will have no helpers.[3]

يُؤۡمِنُونَ بِٱللَّهِ وَٱلۡيَوۡمِ ٱلۡأٓخِرِ وَيَأۡمُرُونَ بِٱلۡمَعۡرُوفِ وَيَنۡهَوۡنَ عَنِ ٱلۡمُنكَرِ وَيُسَٰرِعُونَ فِي ٱلۡخَيۡرَٰتِۖ وَأُوْلَٰٓئِكَ مِنَ ٱلصَّٰلِحِينَ ١١٤

They believe in Allah and the Last Day, encourage good and forbid evil, and race with one another in doing good. They are ˹truly˺ among the righteous.[4]

لُعِنَ ٱلَّذِينَ كَفَرُواْ مِنۢ بَنِيٓ إِسۡرَٰٓءِيلَ عَلَىٰ لِسَانِ دَاوُۥدَ وَعِيسَى ٱبۡنِ مَرۡيَمَۚ ذَٰلِكَ بِمَا عَصَواْ وَّكَانُواْ يَعۡتَدُونَ ٧٨ كَانُواْ لَا يَتَنَاهَوۡنَ عَن مُّنكَرٖ فَعَلُوهُۚ لَبِئۡسَ مَا كَانُواْ يَفۡعَلُونَ ٧٩تَرَىٰ كَثِيرٗا مِّنۡهُمۡ يَتَوَلَّوۡنَ ٱلَّذِينَ كَفَرُواْۚ لَبِئۡسَ مَا قَدَّمَتۡ لَهُمۡ أَنفُسُهُمۡ أَن سَخِطَ ٱللَّهُ عَلَيۡهِمۡ وَفِي ٱلۡعَذَابِ هُمۡ خَٰلِدُونَ ٨٠ وَلَوۡ كَانُواْ يُؤۡمِنُونَ بِٱللَّهِ وَٱلنَّبِيِّ وَمَآ أُنزِلَ إِلَيۡهِ مَا ٱتَّخَذُوهُمۡ أَوۡلِيَآءَ وَلَٰكِنَّ كَثِيرٗا مِّنۡهُمۡ فَٰسِقُونَ ٨١

The disbelievers among the Children of Israel were condemned in the revelations of David and Jesus, son of Mary. That was for their disobedience and violations. The disbelievers among the ChThey did not forbid one another from doing evil. Evil indeed was what they did! You see many of them taking the disbelievers as allies. Truly wicked are their misdeeds, which have earned them Allah's wrath. And they will be in everlasting torment. Had they believed in Allah, the Prophet, and what has been revealed to him, they would have never taken those ˹pagans˺ as allies. But most of them are rebellious.[5]

---

[1] Âl-i İmrân 3:104
[2] Âl-i İmrân 3:110
[3] Âl-i İmrân 3:111
[4] Âl-i İmrân 3:114
[5] Al-Ma'idah, 5:78- 81

ٱلَّذِينَ يَتَّبِعُونَ ٱلرَّسُولَ ٱلنَّبِيَّ ٱلْأُمِّيَّ ٱلَّذِى يَجِدُونَهُۥ مَكْتُوبًا عِندَهُمْ فِى ٱلتَّوْرَىٰةِ وَٱلْإِنجِيلِ يَأْمُرُهُم بِٱلْمَعْرُوفِ وَيَنْهَىٰهُمْ عَنِ ٱلْمُنكَرِ وَيُحِلُّ لَهُمُ ٱلطَّيِّبَٰتِ وَيُحَرِّمُ عَلَيْهِمُ ٱلْخَبَٰٓئِثَ وَيَضَعُ عَنْهُمْ إِصْرَهُمْ وَٱلْأَغْلَٰلَ ٱلَّتِى كَانَتْ عَلَيْهِمْ ۚ فَٱلَّذِينَ ءَامَنُوا۟ بِهِۦ وَعَزَّرُوهُ وَنَصَرُوهُ وَٱتَّبَعُوا۟ ٱلنُّورَ ٱلَّذِىٓ أُنزِلَ مَعَهُۥٓ ۙ أُو۟لَٰٓئِكَ هُمُ ٱلْمُفْلِحُونَ ١٥٧

"*They are the ones who follow the Messenger, the unlettered Prophet, whose description they find in their Torah and the Gospel. He commands them to do good and forbids them from evil, permits for them what is lawful and forbids to them what is impure, and relieves them from their burdens and the shackles that bound them. Only those who believe in him, honour and support him, and follow the light sent down to him will be successful.*"[6]

خُذِ ٱلْعَفْوَ وَأْمُرْ بِٱلْعُرْفِ وَأَعْرِضْ عَنِ ٱلْجَٰهِلِينَ ١٩٩

Be gracious, enjoin what is right, and turn away from those who act ignorantly.[7]

وَٱلْمُؤْمِنُونَ وَٱلْمُؤْمِنَٰتُ بَعْضُهُمْ أَوْلِيَآءُ بَعْضٍ ۚ يَأْمُرُونَ بِٱلْمَعْرُوفِ وَيَنْهَوْنَ عَنِ ٱلْمُنكَرِ وَيُقِيمُونَ ٱلصَّلَوٰةَ وَيُؤْتُونَ ٱلزَّكَوٰةَ وَيُطِيعُونَ ٱللَّهَ وَرَسُولَهُۥٓ ۚ أُو۟لَٰٓئِكَ سَيَرْحَمُهُمُ ٱللَّهُ ۗ إِنَّ ٱللَّهَ عَزِيزٌ حَكِيمٌ ٧١

The believers, both men and women, are guardians of one another. They encourage good and forbid evil, establish prayer and pay alms-tax, and obey Allah and His Messenger. It is they who will be shown Allah's mercy. Surely Allah is Almighty, All-Wise.[8]

ٱلَّذِينَ إِن مَّكَّنَّٰهُمْ فِى ٱلْأَرْضِ أَقَامُوا۟ ٱلصَّلَوٰةَ وَءَاتَوُا۟ ٱلزَّكَوٰةَ وَأَمَرُوا۟ بِٱلْمَعْرُوفِ وَنَهَوْا۟ عَنِ ٱلْمُنكَرِ ۗ وَلِلَّهِ عَٰقِبَةُ ٱلْأُمُورِ ٤١

They are those who, if established in the land by Us, would perform prayer, pay alms-tax, encourage what is good, and forbid what is evil. And with Allah rests the outcome of all affairs.[9]

يَٰبُنَىَّ أَقِمِ ٱلصَّلَوٰةَ وَأْمُرْ بِٱلْمَعْرُوفِ وَٱنْهَ عَنِ ٱلْمُنكَرِ وَٱصْبِرْ عَلَىٰ مَآ أَصَابَكَ ۖ إِنَّ ذَٰلِكَ مِنْ عَزْمِ ٱلْأُمُورِ ١٧

"*O my dear son! Establish prayer, encourage what is good and forbid what is evil, and endure patiently whatever befalls you. Surely this is a resolve to aspire to.*[10]

Notice that Luqman (عليه السلام) connects enjoining good and forbidding evil directly with patience over the harm that may result. This shows that harm and difficulty are EXPECTED consequences of this obligation, yet we are commanded to do it anyway and to bear the consequences with patience.

The Madkhali position inverts this wisdom by saying: "*If there might be harm or fitna, do not speak against evil.*" But Allah and His wise servant Luqman say: "*Enjoin good and forbid evil, and when harm comes to you as a result, be patient.*"

---

[6] Al-A'raf - 7:157-158
[7] Al-A'raf - 7:199
[8] At-Tawbah - 9:71
[9] Al-Hajj 22:41
[10] Luqman 31:17

These verses establish several fundamental principles that directly refute the Madkhali position:

First: The Command is Absolute and Universal

Notice that in all these verses, Allah does not exempt any class of people from being subject to enjoining good and forbidding evil. The command says:

"يَأۡمُرُونَ بِٱلۡمَعۡرُوفِ وَيَنۡهَوۡنَ عَنِ ٱلۡمُنكَرِ"

"*enjoining what is right and forbidding what is wrong*"[11] without any exception for rulers, governors, or those in authority.

If Allah intended for rulers to be exempt from accountability, He would have clearly stated so, as He did with other specific rulings in the Qur'an. The silence on this matter indicates the universality of the command.

Second: The Characteristics of the Believing Community

In Surah Ali 'Imran , Allah describes this Ummah as "خَيۡرَ أُمَّةٍ أُخۡرِجَتۡ لِلنَّاسِ" "*the best nation raised for mankind*".[12] specifically because they "تَأۡمُرُونَ بِٱلۡمَعۡرُوفِ وَتَنۡهَوۡنَ عَنِ ٱلۡمُنكَرِ" "*enjoin good and forbid evil.*".[13]

The Madkhali position would strip this Ummah of its defining characteristic. **If we cannot hold the most powerful among us accountable, then how can we claim to truly enjoin good and forbid evil?** The corruption and oppression of a single ruler affects millions, yet we are told to remain silent about it **while correcting the minor sins of common people?** This is a complete inversion of priorities.

Third: The Curse Upon Bani Israel Is A Direct Warning

The verses from Surah Al-Ma'idah are particularly devastating to the Madkhali argument. Allah curses the Children of Israel specifically because "كَانُواْ لَا يَتَنَاهَوۡنَ عَن مُّنكَرٖ فَعَلُوهُ" "*They did not forbid one another from the wrongdoing they committed*" [14]

Imam Ibn Kathir (may Allah have mercy on him) explained in his tafsir:

Allah said,

تَرَى كَثِيراً مِّنْهُمْ يَتَوَلَّوْنَ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُواْ

(You see many of them taking the disbelievers as their friends.) Mujahid said that this Ayah refers to the hypocrites. Allah's statement,

[11] Âl-i İmrân 3:114
[12] Âl-i İmrân 3:110
[13] Âl-i İmrân 3:110
[14] Al-Ma'idah, 5:78- 81

لَبِئْسَ مَا قَدَّمَتْ لَهُمْ أَنفُسُهُمْ

(Evil indeed is that which they have sent forward before themselves;) by giving their loyalty and support to the disbelievers, instead of the believers. This evil act caused them to have hypocrisy in their hearts and brought them the anger of Allah, that will remain with them until the Day of Return. Allah said;

أَن سَخِطَ اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِمْ

(for that (reason) Allah is wrath with them) because of what they did. Allah next said that,

وَفِى الْعَذَابِ هُمْ خَـٰلِدُونَ

(in torment they will abide) on the Day of Resurrection. Allah's statement,

وَلَوْ كَانُوا يُؤْمِنُونَ بِاللهِ والنَّبِىِّ وَمَا أُنْزِلَ إِلَيْهِ مَا اتَّخَذُوهُمْ أَوْلِيَآءَ

(And had they believed in Allah, and in the Prophet and in what has been revealed to him, never would they have taken them as friends.) meaning, had they sincerely believed in Allah, His Messenger and the Qur'an, they would not have committed the evil act of supporting the disbelievers in secret and being enemies with those who believe in Allah, the Prophet and what was revealed to him,

وَلَـٰكِنَّ كَثِيراً مِّنْهُمْ فَـٰسِقُونَ

(but many of them are rebellious). disobedient to Allah and His Messenger and defiant of the Ayat of His revelation that He sent down.[15]

The very next verse connects their silence about evil with their alliance with the disbelievers: "تَرَىٰ كَثِيرًا مِّنْهُمْ يَتَوَلَّوْنَ ٱلَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا۟" "*You see many of them taking the disbelievers as allies*" [16]. This is a proof that remaining silent about the evil of leaders leads to compromising the religion itself.

Are we not afraid of falling under the same curse that befell the Children of Israel? When we see our rulers commit oppression, violate the Shari'ah, ally with the enemies of Islam, steal from the public treasury, and spread corruption in the land, and yet we are told to remain silent, are we not repeating the same sin that earned them Allah's curse?

[15] Tafseer Ibn Kathir 5:79
[16] Al-Ma'idah, 5:80

Fourth: Enjoining Good is Among the Obligations of Those in Power

In Surah Al-Hajj, Allah describes the righteous rulers:

"ٱلَّذِينَ إِن مَّكَّنَّـٰهُمْ فِى ٱلْأَرْضِ أَقَامُوا۟ ٱلصَّلَوٰةَ وَءَاتَوُا۟ ٱلزَّكَوٰةَ وَأَمَرُوا۟ بِٱلْمَعْرُوفِ وَنَهَوْا۟ عَنِ ٱلْمُنكَرِ"

Those who, if We give them authority in the land, establish prayer, give zakah, and enjoin what is right and forbid what is wrong[17]

This verse establishes that enjoining good and forbidding evil is a PRIMARY OBLIGATION of rulers, not an exemption they enjoy. If the ruler himself abandons this obligation or violates it by committing evil, then speaking against him becomes even more necessary, as he has violated the very purpose of his authority.

2. The Obligation to Stand for Justice Even Against Oneself

۞ يَـٰٓأَيُّهَا ٱلَّذِينَ ءَامَنُوا۟ كُونُوا۟ قَوَّٰمِينَ بِٱلْقِسْطِ شُهَدَآءَ لِلَّهِ وَلَوْ عَلَىٰٓ أَنفُسِكُمْ أَوِ ٱلْوَٰلِدَيْنِ وَٱلْأَقْرَبِينَ ۚ إِن يَكُنْ غَنِيًّا أَوْ فَقِيرًا فَٱللَّهُ أَوْلَىٰ بِهِمَا ۖ فَلَا تَتَّبِعُوا۟ ٱلْهَوَىٰٓ أَن تَعْدِلُوا۟ ۚ وَإِن تَلْوُۥٓا۟ أَوْ تُعْرِضُوا۟ فَإِنَّ ٱللَّهَ كَانَ بِمَا تَعْمَلُونَ خَبِيرًا ١٣٥

O believers! Stand firm for justice as witnesses for Allah even if it is against yourselves, your parents, or close relatives. Be they rich or poor, Allah is best to ensure their interests. So do not let your desires cause you to deviate ˹from justice˺. If you distort the testimony or refuse to give it, then ˹know that˺ Allah is certainly All-Aware of what you do.[18]

These verses establish a principle that completely dismantles the Madkhali position through a simple logical argument:

The Argument from the Lesser to the Greater

Allah commands us to stand for justice and bear witness even when it is:

1. Against ourselves
2. Against our parents
3. Against our close relatives

Now, who has more right upon us: our parents or a ruler? Obviously our parents, for Allah paired honoring them with His worship:

۞ وَقَضَىٰ رَبُّكَ أَلَّا تَعْبُدُوٓا۟ إِلَّآ إِيَّاهُ وَبِٱلْوَٰلِدَيْنِ إِحْسَـٰنًا ۚ إِمَّا يَبْلُغَنَّ عِندَكَ ٱلْكِبَرَ أَحَدُهُمَآ أَوْ كِلَاهُمَا فَلَا تَقُل لَّهُمَآ أُفٍّ وَلَا تَنْهَرْهُمَا وَقُل لَّهُمَا قَوْلًا كَرِيمًا ٢٣

For your Lord has decreed that you worship none but Him. And honour your parents. If one or both of them reach old age in your care, never say to them ˹even˺ 'ugh,' nor yell at them. Rather, address them respectfully.

[17] Al-Hajj 22:41
[18] An-Nisa 4:135

Yet He still commands us to testify against them if justice requires it. So if we must speak the truth even against our parents, despite their immense rights over us, then by what logic are rulers exempt? The ruler has no blood relationship with us, did not raise us from childhood, did not sacrifice for us as parents do. Yet the Madkhalis would have us believe that while we must testify against our own parents for justice, we must remain silent when the ruler oppresses millions?

The verse than specifically mentions "إِن يَكُنْ غَنِيًّا أَوْ فَقِيرًا" "*Be they rich or poor*", addressing the natural human tendency to favor the powerful. Allah commands us to overcome this base tendency. The message is wAllahi clear: **power and authority do not grant immunity from accountability**.

Allah than says: "فَلَا تَتَّبِعُوا ٱلْهَوَىٰٓ أَن تَعْدِلُوا" "So *do not let your desires cause you to deviate from justice*".

What desires prevent justice regarding rulers? Fear of punishment, hope for favors, love of comfort and safety, desire to be close to power. **The Madkhali methodology is built entirely upon following these desires**. They rationalize their silence by claiming to prevent "fitna," but in reality **they follow their fear and desire for safety.**

Two Ways of Violating This Command

Allah warns: "وَإِن تَلْوُۥٓا أَوْ تُعْرِضُوا" "*If you distort the testimony or refuse to give it*".

The Madkhali scholars commit both sins: they **distort** by calling tyrannical rulers "legitimate authorities" who must be obeyed absolutely and they **refuse** by prohibiting others from speaking out against injustice

Allah warns: "فَإِنَّ ٱللَّهَ كَانَ بِمَا تَعْمَلُونَ خَبِيرًا" *You may fool the people and receive praise from rulers, but Allah knows your true motivation.*

3. The Prohibition of Inclining Toward Oppressors

وَلَا تَرْكَنُوٓا۟ إِلَى ٱلَّذِينَ ظَلَمُوا۟ فَتَمَسَّكُمُ ٱلنَّارُ وَمَا لَكُم مِّن دُونِ ٱللَّهِ مِنْ أَوْلِيَآءَ ثُمَّ لَا تُنصَرُونَ ١١٣

And do not be inclined to the wrongdoers or you will be touched by the Fire. For then you would have no protectors other than Allah, nor would you be helped.[19]

The Meaning of "Inclining"

The scholars of tafsir explain that "تَرْكَنُوا" (inclining) includes:

- Supporting the oppressor in his oppression
- Remaining silent about his injustice when able to speak
- Praising him and beautifying his oppression

[19] Hud 11:113

- Justifying his actions with false religious interpretations

The Madkhali methodology embodies the very "inclining" that Allah forbids. They support tyrannical rulers through absolute obedience, remain silent about clear oppression, praise tyrants as "legitimate authorities," and justify oppression by misinterpreting texts. **This is not merely inclining, this is complete submission to tyrants at the expense of the religion.**

The severe warning is clear: "فَتَمَسَّكُمُ ٱلنَّارُ" "*lest you be touched by the Fire*". The tyrant you remained silent for **will not protect you in the Hereafter.**

4. The Command to Cooperate Only in Righteousness

تَعْتَدُوا۟ ۘ وَتَعَاوَنُوا۟ عَلَى ٱلْبِرِّ وَٱلتَّقْوَىٰ ۖ وَلَا تَعَاوَنُوا۟ عَلَى ٱلْإِثْمِ وَٱلْعُدْوَٰنِ ۚ وَٱتَّقُوا۟ ٱللَّهَ ۖ إِنَّ ٱللَّهَ شَدِيدُ ٱلْعِقَابِ

Cooperate with one another in goodness and righteousness, and do not cooperate in sin and transgression. And be mindful of Allah. Surely Allah is severe in punishment[20]

This verse establishes that **cooperation has limits**. We cooperate with rulers when they call for righteousness, but when they call to sin and aggression, **cooperation becomes forbidden.**

The Madkhali position violates this by demanding absolute obedience regardless of the ruler's actions, even when he implements laws contrary to Shari'ah, oppresses the innocent, steals public wealth, or allies with enemies of Islam. This is cooperation in sin, explicitly forbidden by Allah.

5. Examples from the Qur'an of Speaking Against Tyrannical Authority

The Qur'an does not merely command speaking truth to power in abstract terms, it provides concrete examples of righteous people who stood against tyranny.

A. The Believer from Pharaoh's Family

وَقَالَ رَجُلٌ مُّؤْمِنٌ مِّنْ ءَالِ فِرْعَوْنَ يَكْتُمُ إِيمَـٰنَهُۥٓ أَتَقْتُلُونَ رَجُلًا أَن يَقُولَ رَبِّىَ ٱللَّهُ وَقَدْ جَآءَكُم بِٱلْبَيِّنَـٰتِ مِن رَّبِّكُمْ ۖ وَإِن يَكُ كَـٰذِبًا فَعَلَيْهِ كَذِبُهُۥ ۖ وَإِن يَكُ صَادِقًا يُصِبْكُم بَعْضُ ٱلَّذِى يَعِدُكُمْ ۖ إِنَّ ٱللَّهَ لَا يَهْدِى مَنْ هُوَ مُسْرِفٌ كَذَّابٌ ٢٨

A believing man from Pharaoh's people, who was hiding his faith, argued, "Will you kill a man1 ˹only˺ for saying: 'My Lord is Allah,' while he has in fact come to you with clear proofs from your Lord? If he is a liar, it will be to his own loss. But if he is truthful, then you will be afflicted with some of what he is threatening you with. Surely Allah does not guide whoever is a transgressor, a total liar.[21]

[20] Al-Ma'idah 5:2
[21] Ghafir 40:28

The Qur'an praises this man who stood up and spoke against Pharaoh's tyranny despite the great danger. **This is presented as an example to follow, not avoid.** If Allah wanted us to remain silent before tyrants, why would He immortalize this story in the Qur'an as a model?

B. Musa (عليه السلام) Confronting Pharaoh

فَأْتِيَا فِرْعَوْنَ فَقُولَآ إِنَّا رَسُولُ رَبِّ ٱلْعَٰلَمِينَ ١٦ أَنْ أَرْسِلْ مَعَنَا بَنِىٓ إِسْرَٰٓءِيلَ ١٧

Go to Pharaoh and say, 'We are messengers from the Lord of all worlds, ˹commanded to say:˺ 'Let the Children of Israel go with us."[22]

Allah commanded Musa to go directly to the most tyrannical ruler and speak truth to him. When the Madkhalis say we cannot criticize rulers, they contradict the methodology of the Prophets themselves.

C. The People of the Trench

The story in Surah Al-Buruj tells of believers who refused to abandon their faith despite facing a tyrannical king. They are praised, not condemned, for their stance. The Qur'an commemorates their resistance against oppression, not their submission to it.

يَٰٓأَيُّهَا ٱلَّذِينَ ءَامَنُوا۟ كُونُوا۟ قَوَّٰمِينَ لِلَّهِ شُهَدَآءَ بِٱلْقِسْطِ ۖ وَلَا يَجْرِمَنَّكُمْ شَنَـَٔانُ قَوْمٍ عَلَىٰٓ أَلَّا تَعْدِلُوا۟ ۚ ٱعْدِلُوا۟ هُوَ أَقْرَبُ لِلتَّقْوَىٰ ۖ وَٱتَّقُوا۟ ٱللَّهَ ۚ إِنَّ ٱللَّهَ خَبِيرٌۢ بِمَا تَعْمَلُونَ ٨

O believers! Stand firm for Allah and bear true testimony. Do not let the hatred of a people lead you to injustice. Be just! That is closer to righteousness. And be mindful of Allah. Surely Allah is All-Aware of what you do.[23]

3. The Condemnation of Those Who Conceal the Truth

إِنَّ ٱلَّذِينَ يَكْتُمُونَ مَآ أَنزَلْنَا مِنَ ٱلْبَيِّنَٰتِ وَٱلْهُدَىٰ مِنۢ بَعْدِ مَا بَيَّنَّٰهُ لِلنَّاسِ فِى ٱلْكِتَٰبِ ۙ أُو۟لَٰٓئِكَ يَلْعَنُهُمُ ٱللَّهُ وَيَلْعَنُهُمُ ٱللَّٰعِنُونَ ١٥٩

Those who hide the clear proofs and guidance that We have revealed—after We made it clear for humanity in the Book—will be condemned by Allah and ˹all˺ those who condemn.[24]

This verse condemns those who conceal clear proofs and guidance after Allah made them clear. Remaining silent about a ruler's oppression and deviation is concealing the truth that Allah commanded us to uphold.

The Madkhali scholars conceal:

[22] Ash-Shu'ara 26:16-17
[23] Al-Ma'idah 5:8
[24] Al-Baqarah 2:159-160

- The verses commanding enjoining good and forbidding evil universally
- The hadiths about speaking truth to tyrants
- The examples of the Salaf who stood against unjust rulers

They hide these proofs to serve political authority. The verse warns they are cursed by Allah and by all who curse.

وَقَالَ رَجُلٌ مُّؤْمِنٌ مِّنْ ءَالِ فِرْعَوْنَ يَكْتُمُ إِيمَـٰنَهُۥٓ أَتَقْتُلُونَ رَجُلًا أَن يَقُولَ رَبِّىَ ٱللَّهُ وَقَدْ جَآءَكُم بِٱلْبَيِّنَـٰتِ مِن رَّبِّكُمْ ۖ وَإِن يَكُ كَـٰذِبًا فَعَلَيْهِ كَذِبُهُۥ ۖ وَإِن يَكُ صَادِقًا يُصِبْكُم بَعْضُ ٱلَّذِى يَعِدُكُمْ ۖ إِنَّ ٱللَّهَ لَا يَهْدِى مَنْ هُوَ مُسْرِفٌ كَذَّابٌ ٢٨

A believing man from Pharaoh's people, who was hiding his faith, argued, "Will you kill a man ˹only˺ for saying: 'My Lord is Allah,' while he has in fact come to you with clear proofs from your Lord? If he is a liar, it will be to his own loss. But if he is truthful, then you will be afflicted with some of what he is threatening you with. Surely Allah does not guide whoever is a transgressor, a total liar.

Allah presents this believing man as an example of courage and faith. He spoke out against Pharaoh, the most tyrannical ruler in history despite the grave danger to himself.

If speaking against tyrannical rulers was forbidden, A**llah would have condemned this man or at least not praised his action.** Instead, Allah immortalized his speech in the Qur'an for all time as a model for believers.

The Madkhalis tell us to remain silent to "avoid fitna," but Allah shows us a man who spoke truth to the ultimate tyrant and is praised for it. Who are we going to follow?

Part 2: Evidence from the Sunnah

1. The Greatest Jihad

The Prophet (ﷺ) said, "The best type of Jihad (striving in the way of Allah) is speaking a true word in the presence of a tyrant ruler."[25]

This hadith explicitly designates speaking truth to tyrannical authority as the BEST form of jihad, not something forbidden or discouraged.

In another narration:

Ibn Abbas reported: The Messenger fo Allah, peace and blessings be upon him, said, "*The master of the martyrs on the Day of Resurrection is Hamzah ibn 'Abdul Muttalib, and a man who stands up to a tyrannical leader, prohibiting him from evil and enjoining good upon him, and he is killed for it.*"[26]

[25] Riyad as-Salihin 194
[26] al-Mu'jam al-Awsaṭ lil-Ṭabarānī 4079

The Prophet (ﷺ) placed such a person in the highest rank of martyrs after Hamza, demonstrating the immense virtue of this act.

2. Accountability of Rulers

Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said, "A *ruler who, having control over the affairs of the Muslims, does not strive diligently for their betterment and does not serve them sincerely, will not enter Jannah with them.*"[27]

The Messenger of Allah, peace and blessings be upon him, said, "*No servant is given authority by Allah, but he does not fulfill its duties sincerely, except that he will never smell the fragrance of Paradise.*"[28]

4. The Example of Abu Bakr (may Allah be pleased with him)

Ibn Hisham reported: Abu Bakr, may Allah be pleased with him, began to speak at his inauguration, praising Allah as He deserves and saying, "*To proceed: O people, I have been put in authority over you, but I am not the best of you. If I do the right thing, then help me. If I do wrong, then correct me. Truthfulness is a sacred trust, and lying is a betrayal. The weak among you are strong in my sight so I will relieve their suffering as is their right, if Allah wills. The strong among you are weak in my sight so I will take what is due from them, if Allah wills. No people abandon jihad in the way of Allah but that Allah strikes them with disgrace. Obscenity never spreads among people but that Allah afflicts them with trials. Obey me as long as I obey Allah and His Messenger, but If I disobey Allah and His Messenger, then you are not obligated to obey me. Now, stand for your prayer, and may Allah have mercy upon you.*"[29]

This establishes that even the best of the Khulafa acknowledged the people's right to hold them accountable and correct them.

[27] Riyad as-Salihin 653
[28] Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī 7150, Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim 142
[29] al-Sīrah al-Nabawīyah 2/661

5. 'Umar ibn Al-Khattab's Position

'Umar ibn Al-Khattab (may Allah be pleased with him) said while on the minbar: "O *people! If you see any crookedness in me, straighten it!*" A man from the audience stood up and said: "*By Allah, O Commander of the Faithful, if we see crookedness in you, we will straighten it with our swords*!" Umar replied: "*Praise be to Allah, who has placed within the ummah of Muhammad someone who would correct Umar's crookedness with the edge of his sword*"[30]

In another incident, 'Umar (may Allah be pleased with him) said: "W*hat would you do if I deviated?*" A man said: "*We would straighten you as we straighten the arrow.*" 'Umar said: "*All praise is due to Allah.*"

6. The Prohibition of Obeying in Sin

'Ali ibn Abi Talib (may Allah be pleased with him) reported that the Prophet (ﷺ) sent a military expedition and appointed a man as their leader. He kindled a fire and said: "Enter it." Some people intended to enter it, while others said: "We fled from it (by accepting Islam)." The matter was mentioned to the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) and he said to those who had intended to enter the fire: "If you had entered it, you would have remained in it until the Day of Resurrection." And he said a good word to the others and said: "There is no obedience in sinful matters; obedience is only in what is good."[31]

'Abdullah ibn 'Umar (may Allah be pleased with him) reported that the Prophet (ﷺ) said: "*A Muslim has to listen to and obey (the ruler) whether he likes it or not, as long as he is not ordered to commit a sin. If he is ordered to commit a sin, then there is no listening or obeying.*"[32]

7. Warning Against Silent Scholars

Abu Bakr As-Siddiq (may Allah be pleased with him) said: "*O you people! You recite this Verse: 'O you who believe! Take care of your ownselves. If you follow the (right) guidance [and enjoin what is right (Islamic Monotheism and all that Islam orders one to do) and forbid what is wrong (polytheism, disbelief and all that Islam has forbidden)] no hurt can come to you from those who are in error.'* (5:105) *But I have heard Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) saying: "When people see an oppressor but do not prevent him from (doing evil), it is likely that Allah will punish them all.*"[33]

Our prophet said; '*When the people see the wrongdoer and they do not take him by the hand, then soon Allah shall envelope you in a punishment from him.*'"[34]

---

[30] Sirat 'amir almuminin Umar bin al-Khattab shakhsiatah waasruhu, 472
[31] Tafseer Ibn Kathir 4:59
[32] Sahih al-Bukhari 7144
[33] Riyad as-Salihin 197
[34] Jami` at-Tirmidhi 2168

9. The Three Types of Jihad

I heard the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) say, "*Whosoever of you sees an evil, let him change it with his hand; and if he is not able to do so, then [let him change it] with his tongue; and if he is not able to do so, then with his heart — and that is the weakest of faith.*"[35]

This hadith establishes a hierarchy of response to evil, with physical action being first, then speech, then heart. The Madkhali position would have us skip straight to the weakest form even when speech is possible.

Conclusion

The evidence from the Qur'an and Sunnah is clear and overwhelming: **holding rulers accountable when they commit injustice is not only permissible, but obligatory**.

Allah commands us to enjoin good and forbid evil universally, with **no exemption for those in power**. He curses those who remained silent about evil as happened to Bani Israel (5:78-79), forbids inclining toward oppressors (11:113), and commands us to stand for justice even against ourselves and our parents (4:135). If we must testify against our own parents, how can rulers be exempt?

The Prophet (ﷺ) called speaking truth to tyrants "**the best jihad**" and placed those who stand against tyrannical rulers among **the highest martyrs after Hamza**. Abu Bakr and 'Umar publicly told the people to correct them, even with force if necessary. The Prophet (ﷺ) warned: "***When people see an oppressor but do not prevent him, Allah will punish them all.***"

The Madkhali position contradicts these explicit texts and follows desire (hawa) - fear of punishment, hope for favors, love of comfort. They distort the religion to serve political authority, committing the exact sin for which Bani Israel was cursed: remaining silent about evil.

Don't forget that complete silence in the face of oppression is abandoning a pillar of our faith.

When we stand before Allah:

- The ruler we stayed silent for will not protect us
- Our fear of him will not excuse us
- Allah warned: "***Do not incline toward oppressors, lest you be touched by the Fire***"

The Prophet (ﷺ) told us the best jihad is a word of truth before a tyrant. To abandon this obligation is to abandon what makes this Ummah great.

[35] Sahih Muslim 49a

We ask Allah to guide us to truth and give us courage to stand for justice, even in the face of tyranny.

وَقُلْ جَآءَ ٱلْحَقُّ وَزَهَقَ ٱلْبَـٰطِلُ ۚ إِنَّ ٱلْبَـٰطِلَ كَانَ زَهُوقًا ٨١

And declare, "The truth has come and falsehood has vanished. Indeed, falsehood is bound to vanish."[36]

Tiktok- IftiraTarihUtansin[37]

Instagram- IftiraTarihUtansin_[38]

Discord- iftiratarihutansin

Twitter- IftiraTarihUtansin[39]

Website- Hayatimanvecihad8[40]

Acces our website;

[36] Al-Isra 17:81
[37] https://www.tiktok.com/@iftiratarihutansin?_t=ZN-8uM21ZWsBmQ&_r=1

[38] https://www.instagram.com/iftiratarihutansin_/

[39] https://x.com/iftiratarihutan

[40] https://hayatimanvecihad8.wordpress.com/